The Evaluation of the Motifs and Styles of the Architectural Sculpture of the Byzantine Age in Antalya and Lycia

Sema ALPASLAN*  

The objective of the survey we have been doing since 1998 on "The Architectural Sculptures of the Byzantine Age in Antalya and Lycia" is to document the in situ, broken or spoli sculptures in the Byzantine settlements, which have not been excavated, with the permission of the Ministry of Culture of the Republic of Turkey. A total of 348 pieces of sculptures belonging to the Byzantine Age have been identified and documented at the 43 settlements in the region, at the Antalya Kaleici and the Gumanun Mosque and also at the Antalya Archaeological Museum1.

Lycia covers the region from the city of Antalya to Fethiye in the West on the Mediterranean coast, and includes Korkuteli near the former Phrygian border and the Taurus Mountains in the North2. We have documented in our research the sculptures in Rhodiapolis, Corni, Acilissus, Idebessus, Melanippe, Gagae, Kumluca and the Finike Cumhuriyet Park in Eastern Lycia; the sculptures of Alakilise, Alacahisar and Karabel Church in the village of Zeytin attached to the town of Muskar, which is situated between Demre and Cağman in Central Lycia; and also the sculptures found in the churches at Devekuyusu, Camarska, Çağman and Güceymen Hill. We have also made research at Armutalan-Göçekköristan in Upper Beymelek near Demre, the Chapel in Beymelek; in the basilicas at Gürses on the Demre-Kaş highway, Apollonia, Dolichiste (Kekova Island), Armea and at the harbor city of Aperlae. We carried out research at Pintra, Sydima, Balbura and Bubon in Western Lycia. Due to the fact that there is a similarity in the characteristics of the motifs and styles of the sculptures in Antalya with those in Lycia, the spoli sculptures and those on the ground were also identified and documented at the Antalya Kaleici and the Gumanun Mosque, and the sculptures at the Antalya Archaeological Museum, which had come to the Museum from Lycia and that do not belong to the group of findings from the excavations in the region, have also been studied.

---

* Assoc. Prof. Sema Alpaskan, Hacettepe University, Faculty of Letters, Department of Art History, Ankara.

1 I would like to thank The Sura & Iman Karaç Research Institute on Mediterranean Civilizations for their financial assistance of our project. They will be presented soon with the book we have been preparing. Alpaskan 1999, 29-38; Alpaskan 2000, 107-114.

2 See for the settlements, Jacobek 1994, 856-902; Foss 1996.
This study will select a group of works from among the sculptures of the Lycian region that will enlighten the era between the seventh and twelfth centuries, despite the surveys and excavations continuing in Lycia, because the publications related to the sculptures from the Byzantine Age and belonging to the period between the seventh and twelfth centuries are rather limited. This survey will explore the problems of dating them by providing examples. A great majority of the Byzantine churches in the region are buildings that date from the sixth century and they have suffered major destruction. This destruction was probably the result of the major earthquake in 530. However, buildings were also observed in the region dating from after the sixth century, such as the East Church at Xanthos, the St. Nicholas Church at Myra and the DereaqGa Church. Architectural sculpture production continued due to the renewal over time of the decoration of these buildings, especially the liturgical furnishings such as the templon and ambo. We determined that although most of the architectural sculpture in the region were works dating from the sixth century, because there also existed works belonging to the seventh century and later, we also studied this period. Especially, the masterpieces we found in our survey and the excavation findings at the St. Nicholas Church at Myra, whose structural phases are known, has made a great contribution to the period we studied. For this reason, examples from the finds at the St. Nicholas Church in Demre will be presented as regional material. These examples were found in the excavations that have been made since 1989 under the leadership of Y. Otukon, and the stone finds have been studied by me and have been published.

Our research has proven that certain motifs of the Lycian region were also very popular on the Mediterranean coast. One of these is the ear of wheat. Examples are to be seen on the screens at Aperlae (Fig. 1) and Alakilise, on the basket capital with bird figures and on the templon pier in the Antalya Archaeological Museum, on the screens at the St. Nicholas Church in Demre and on the ciborium arch at Alacahisa7. Other examples from Lycia are the screens at Aperlae and Melanippe, the screen at the DereaqGa Church near Ka and the screens at the Bishops Church in Limyra and the Andriake D Church8. Some other examples from Anatolia outside of the Lycian region are: the screen from the sixth century at the Side Museum, the screen at the Agora in Izmir and the ambo screen in the Archaeological Museum at Manisa9. Examples displaying the same motif in the Mediterranean are the sarcophagus at the Church of Apollinare in Classe in Ravenna, Italy and the impost capital and screen from the seventh century in the Museo Regionale at Syracuse, Sicily10. The capitals dated to the beginning of the sixth century in the Istanbul Archaeological Museum

---

6 Alpaslan 1996.
7 Alpaslan 2000, Fig. 6; Otük 2001, 347 Fig. 4; Alpaslan 2001, 209 Fig. 19.
8 Morganstern 1993, Pi. 13.6; Peschlow 1984, 22-35; Feld 1975, Taf. 132 G.
9 These stone elements are not published.
10 Farioli 1968, Fig. 17 4 c; Cavallo - Campanari 1982, Fig. 206 cat.no. 141.
show that the ear of wheat motif was also used in Constantinople, although not very often\textsuperscript{11}. It is possible to find works in the minor arts from the fourth century to the tenth century, other than in stone sculptures, that are similar to these examples from the sixth and seventh centuries.

One of the most popular motifs, that was characteristic of the Mediterranean coast, was the flower motif with four pointed leaves composed from intersecting circles. Examples of this motif on sculptures can be dated to the period between the sixth and twelfth centuries, but the earliest variation is observed on the floor mosaics in Antioch, dating back to the second half of the third century\textsuperscript{12}. Examples of sculptures of the same type in Anatolia are the lattice-work windows from the sixth century in Antioch\textsuperscript{13}. A perforated-type variation of the motif is found in Lycia at the Gemiler Ada and in the St. Nicholas Church at Demre\textsuperscript{14}. The pier at the Cumhuriyet Park at Finike, the spoli pier in Kaleici, Antalya (Fig. 2), the temple (epistle) and moulding in the Antalya Archaeological Museum, the screen at Aperlae (Fig. 5), the capital in the Antalya Archaeological Museum and the screen and the upper element of screen in the St. Nicholas Church at Demre have the same motif in the relief technique\textsuperscript{15}. The spaces between the motifs are either empty or filled with pearl motifs. Variations of this motif can be seen in the Phrygian and Lydian regions of Anatolia: on the ambo screens at the Uşak Museum, on the ambulatory screen and pier in the Manisa Museum\textsuperscript{16}, on the screen in the Agora at Izmir and in the Scripou Church at Thebes, Bocotia, Greece, dating from the ninth century. These variations are observed in Byzantine art over a long period of time from the third century up until the twelfth century in painting and the minor arts, as well as in sculptures\textsuperscript{17}. Although I think that the stone examples may belong to different centuries of the Middle Byzantine Period, due to the fact that there are very few parallels published in this group, precise dating is difficult.

The diamond shaped, carved motif is observed in the sculptures on the coasts and islands of the Mediterranean during the Middle Byzantine Age. It is interesting to observe that among the examples to be found in Lycia, this motif was used at Karabel (Figs. 4 and 5) and Alakilise, a structure from the sixth century, for the pier and column capitals, the screen, the lintel and the capital from the same century today in the Antalya Archaeological Museum. The motif was also used on the spoli screens on the wall of a house at Armea, together with Middle Byzantine compositions\textsuperscript{18}. The same motif was used on the screens in the Derebey Church from the ninth and tenth centuries and in the St. Nicholas Church at Demre which is dated to the Early Byzantine Period, due to the arrow point motif and the flatness of the frame, which I think, belongs to the eighth to ninth centuries\textsuperscript{19}. Other

\textsuperscript{11} Firth - Metzger 1990, Fig. 212 a, b.
\textsuperscript{12} Campbell 1998, 25, 36-37, Pls. 77, 101.
\textsuperscript{13} Stillwell 1941, 134 cat.no. 521 Pl. 27.
\textsuperscript{14} Asaro 1998, Fig. 18; Alpaslan 2001, 198 Fig. 17; Ötükken 1998b, 21-50 Fig. 4; Ötükken 1998a, 171-187 Fig. 6; Peschlow 1998, Taf. 23, 29.
\textsuperscript{15} See for the findings of Demre, Ötükken 1998b, 94; Feld 1975, Taf. 119b; Peschlow 1998, Pl. 23, 29.
\textsuperscript{16} See for the Uşak Museum, Parman 2002, 95, 98 Pl. 67, 82, 83, inv.nos. 53.2.75, 53.1.75.
\textsuperscript{17} Grabar 1963, Pl. XLIII 8, 9; Russell 1982, Fig. 2, 15; Grabar 1963, 127, 138; Weitzmann 1971, Fig. 90.
\textsuperscript{18} Harrison 1972, 191-192 Figs. 2, 9, 19; Alpaslan 2001, 210 Fig. 20.
\textsuperscript{19} Margenstern 1983, Pl. 38.2, 3; DAI neg.nos. 35592-593, R.406c; Peschlow 1990, 207-258.
examples in the Mediterranean area are: the sarcophagus in the Church of Apollinare in Classe at Ravenna, Italy, the eighth to tenth century screens in the Museo Bellomo at Syracuse, Sicily, and the twelfth century marble icon in the Museo Regionale. Consequently, these examples are dated to different centuries of the Middle Byzantine Period.

The use of concentric circles in the development of Byzantine art starts in the fourth century and increases between the sixth and eighth centuries. In the Lycian region, the ambo parapet screen from the sixth century in the Antalya Archaeological Museum and the Middle Byzantine Period screens in the St. Nicholas Church at Demre and in the Kaleici, Antalya (Fig. 6) are made with the incision technique. Two examples of these motifs originating in Constantinople are the sixth to seventh century screens in the Istanbul Archaeological Museum.

The palmette and half palmette and acanthus motifs among the scrolled branches in sculptures in Lycia and the Mediterranean are observed in every century. However, the stylistic characteristics of the shape of the leaf motif should be the determinant in the dating of these works. The concave shape of the leaves in both motifs is observed between the eighth and twelfth centuries, but more frequently from the ninth century. Examples of similar styles of this motif are: on the ion-impost capital at the Finike Cumhuriyet Park in Lycia, on the screen in Kaleici, Antalya (Fig. 7) as well as at Armea (Fig. 8) and Aperlae, on the capital in the Cumanun Mosque in Antalya (Fig. 9) and the temple capital in the St. Nicholas Church at Demre. The mouldings, cornices and capitals from the ninth and thirteenth centuries at the North and South Churches of the Lips Monastery in Istanbul have the same motif. We can limit this style of motif to between the ninth and thirteenth centuries.

The arcade type of composition is to be found in Byzantine sculptures throughout the empire from the sixth century. This composition was also a favorite motif in the Lycian region during the Middle Byzantine Period. Variants of this composition can be seen on the spoli temple epistle at Armea and in the Alaaddin Mosque at Antalya, as well as on the temple epistle (Fig. 10), on the spoli impost in Kaleici (Fig. 11) and on the screen in the Antalya Archaeological Museum. There are similar motifs in Phrygia: the spoli epistle at Akyon, the spoli screen at Söğüt-Kasaba and the temple epistle in the Usak and Burdur Museums. Outside of Anatolia, some of the examples from the Mediterranean region are the ninth century altar in Venice and the eleventh century temple epistle in the San Nicola Church at Bari, Italy. The ninth century and later can be suggested for the dating of the arcade motif due to its increase in use.

---

20 Agnello 1962, Figs. 5, 12, 21, 25; Farid 1968, Fig. 47 h, c; Cavallo - Campanati 1982, Figs. 205, 214 cat. nos. 143, 150.
21 Alpaslan 1996, 107-108 Fig. 15; Harrison 1986, 73-74.
23 Alpaslan 2001, 197 Fig. 13; Örüken 1998, 28 Fig. 5; Lancoronski 1990, 21-27 Fig. 18.
26 Effenberger - Severin 1992, 207 cat. no. 119; Salvatore - Lavernica 1980, 119-120 cat. no. 58 Fig. 58.
One of the original compositions of the Middle Byzantine Period is decoration with geometric motifs such as circles, squares and rhombuses formed into interlocked strips. Within the geometric motifs there are vegetal motifs, figures and symbolic motifs such as crosses. Generally, these compositions are dated to the Middle Byzantine Period, and the examples have been mainly found up to the twelfth century. Therefore, it is interesting that this composition was applied together with the à jour technique of the Justinian period, in the sixth century, on the pier and screen in the Church of St. Nicholas at Demre. A similar example made in the sixth century using the à jour technique can be seen on the ciborium arch in the Antalya Archaeological Museum, but this time with an interlocked square composition. Among the other examples in Kaleçi are the templon pier and epistyle, which reflect Middle Byzantine Period compositions and style (Figs. 12 and 13), and elements to be seen, dated to between the eighth and eleventh centuries, such as the upper part of the templon screen and the templon piers in the St. Nicholas Church at Demre. In addition to the tenth to eleventh century screens in the Archaeological Museum at Istanbul, different variations of these compositions can be seen, dated to between the ninth and twelfth centuries in Greece: on the screen, dating from the ninth century in the St. Gregoire Church at Thebes, Bocotia, on the screen dating from the eleventh century in the Benaki Museum at Athens, on the screen dating from the eleventh century in the Nea Moni Church on Chios Island, on the capital and epistyle of the templon from the tenth to twelfth century in the Hosios Lukas Katholikon at Prothesis, and in Italy: on the screen from the ninth century in Rome and on the screens from the ninth to eleventh centuries in the San Nicola Church at Bari. The accompanying motifs and style should be taken into consideration in the dating of these compositions, as they are to be seen in every period.

A decoration technique that is characteristic of the Middle Byzantine Period are the cavities made by using a drill between interlocked strips and circles and vegetal motifs. We can see examples of this technique in the ninth and tenth century screen and epistyle in the Dereğaçi Church and also on the screen and impost in the St. Nicholas Church at Demre (Fig. 14) and on the screens in the Antalya Archaeological Museum. The drill was used to carve the motifs with the utmost care and skill using the à jour technique during the Early Byzantine Period. However, the drill was used rather unskilfully, carving only one cavity between the motifs during the Middle Byzantine Period, due to the changes in fashion and economic conditions. This style of decoration must have been used in the ninth century and afterwards.

27 Ötüken 1990, 378.
28 Özgün 1988, 219, cat.no. 157 Fig. 133.
29 Alpaslan 2001, 194, 197-198 Figs. 11-12, 14; Alpaslan 1997, 236-237 Figs. 1-2; Feld 1975 Taf. 119 C, D.
31 Morganstern 1993, Pls. 36. 1-2; 57. 1-3, 39. 1-40.1; Feld 1975, Taf. 119 C; Peshlow 1990, Taf. 42.5-10; Ötüken 1998, 27 Fig. 4; Alpaslan 2001, 194 Fig. 12.
We have presented some examples from the Lycian region dated to the period between the seventh and twelfth centuries. When they are considered carefully, it is to be observed that in determining the date of these examples, not only the motifs and compositions, but also the style, ornamentation techniques and even the size of certain elements are important criteria. Moreover, materials also affected the style. Limestone was used as a local material extensively in Lycia; therefore the works had a different style from marble works in Constantinople. It is to be observed that certain motifs used in the region such as the ear of wheat, the flower with four leaves composed of intersecting circles and the diamond shaped incision, are to be seen in different styles all around the shores of the Mediterranean and on the islands. On the other hand, it is also to be observed that these motifs were not used often in the capital of Byzantium. As for some of the motifs in the region, they are of Constantinople origin, such as the palmette and the acanthus motifs with concave leaves, the arcades and the interlocked compositions. At the same time, the à jour technique, which was used very extensively as an ornamentation technique in both the coastal and mountainous regions of Lycia, also originated in the capital of Byzantium. The Byzantine capital's influence on the stone works of Lycia can connected to the masters coming from Constantinople to this region. For example, it is known from historical sources that there were workshops at Arnae in Lycia, and that the masters from Constantinople working at the palace ateliers, came to Lycia and traveled around the region, producing different works. One of the sources for this is the Viata by Nicholas from Sion in the sixth century\textsuperscript{32}. On the other hand, the production of local workshops led to the unity of motif and style within the region. Consequently, in the Byzantine architectural sculpture of Lycia, which we have dated to between the seventh and twelfth centuries according to these criteria, these motifs survived in every period and for hundreds of years, but they were applied to the stone, depicting the taste of the period and the region, and with stylistic and technical changes.

\textsuperscript{32} Sevčenko 1984, 69.
Abbreviations

Buckler - Calder 1999  W. H. Buckler - W. M. Calder, Monuments and Documents from Phrygia and Caria, MAMA VI (1939).
cat.no.  catalog number
Grabar 1953  A. Grabar, La Peinture Byzantine (1953).
inv.no.  inventory number
Lancoronski 1890  K. Lancoronski, Städte Pamphyliens und Pisidiens I (1890).
Macridy 1964

Mendel 1966

Morganstern 1983

Morganstern 1993

neg.no.
negative number

Ozansoy 1996

Ötügen 1996a

Ötügen 1996b

Ötüğen 1998a

Ötügen 1998b

Ötügen 2001

Özgen 1988

Parman 2002

Peschlow 1984

Peschlow 1990

Peschlow 1998

Russell 1982

Salvatore 1980

Şevçenko 1984

Sodini 1980

Stillwell 1941

Weitzmann 1971
Özet

Antalya ve Likya’nın Bizans Çağ
Mimari Plastiğinin Motif ve Stil Değerlendirmesi

1998 yılından itibaren sürdürduğumuz “Antalya ve Lykia’daki Bizans Dönemi’ne Ait Taş Eserler” konulu yüzey araştırmasımda, kazı yapılanların Bizans yerleşimleri ve yapılarından in situ, yıkılmış veya devrirme kullanılmış taş eserler saptanarak belgelenmiştir. Bölgede 43 yerleşim ve yapıda, aynı zamanda Antalya Kaleçi ve Antalya Arkeoloji Müzesi’ne gelen toplam 348 Bizans Dönemi’ne ait taş eser indekslenmiştir.


Fig. 1 Aperlae, screen.

Fig. 2 Kaleici in Antalya, templon pier.

Fig. 3 Aperlae, screen.

Fig. 4 Karabel, East Church, screen.
Fig. 5
Karabel,
East Church, lintel.

Fig. 6
Kaleiçi in Antalya,
screen.

Fig. 7. Kaleiçi in Antalya, screen.

Fig. 8. Armeae, screen.
Fig. 9
Cumanun Mosque in Antalya, capital.

Fig. 10
Alaaddin Mosque in Antalya, temple architrave.

Fig. 11
Kaleici in Antalya, impost.
Fig. 12
Armea, templon pier.

Fig. 13
Kaleiçi in Antalya, at AKMED, templon architrave.

Fig. 14
St. Nicholas's Church in Demre (Myra), impost.